

Emerging the Submerged Realities of Mass Rape in the News of May 1998 Riot

Kezia Sola Gratia

Communication Science Postgraduate Program, Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta Pusat

E-mail: kezia.sola@ui.ac.id

Abstract. *This study employs agenda-setting and media fragmenting theory alongside critical analysis of discourse studies (CADS) to scrutinize media dynamics during the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia. Agenda-setting and Media Framing theories analyze how the media prioritizes and frames specific issues. At the same time, CADS provides a method to present a detailed examination of language and representation in media texts. By analyzing 296 and 261 news articles from two of the most prominent Indonesian online newspaper platforms, the study investigates the submersion of discourses on gender and ethnic violence. Utilizing CADS, the research conducts frequency, collocation, concordance, cluster, and keyword analyses to uncover hidden narratives of gender and ethnic violence within the riot coverage. The analysis reveals significant gaps in discourse on racial and gender-based violence, highlighting the importance of identifying underlying narratives in news coverage. Additionally, the study underscores a void in the coverage of gender and ethnic violence discourses related to the May 1998 Riots, suggesting potential oversight or suppression of crucial aspects. This highlights the media's dual role as a reflector of events and an active influencer of public narratives.*

Keywords: *framing; submerged discourses; cad; gender and ethnic violence*

Article Info:

Received 19 Apr 2024, Revised 04 Aug 2024, Accepted 11 Aug 2024, Available online 30 Dec 2024

Copyright (c) Kezia Sola Gratia

INTRODUCTION

Studies have shown that the narration of the May '98 mass rape is still a taboo topic and is not widely discussed publicly because the state and the general public choose to remain silent about this matter (Himawan, Pohlman, et al., 2022). The May '98 Mass Rape is an example of a narration that was silenced due to public silencing by the government and the lack of discussion in research and mass media in Indonesia regarding the oppression of ethnic Chinese at that time (Ahmadi, 2021; Himawan, Pohlman, et al., 2022). The silence carried out by the government was confirmed by differences in reports from the government-sponsored team and those written by the Volunteer Team for Humanity (TGPF: Tim Gabungan Pencari Fakta) (Budiyanto, 2022). The government-sponsored team's report

characterized the events as a political crisis related to the 1997 presidential election with a limited focus on anti-Chinese aspects, while the Volunteers for Humanity Team provided more detailed accounts of local Chinese individuals who faced anti-Chinese insults during the riots (Budiyanto, 2022).

Using the insights from previous studies highlighting the taboo nature of discussions surrounding the May '98 mass rape and the broader suppression of discourse on ethnic and gender violence in Indonesian media (Ahmadi, 2021; Budiyanto, 2022; Himawan, Louis, et al., 2022), this study delves into the framing of the May 1998 Riots by Indonesian news outlets, particularly concerning the issue of mass rape. By acknowledging the significance of media in shaping public opinion and narratives (Cavanaugh, 2014;

Matusitz & Ochoa, 2018), this study aims to uncover how the discourse on ethnic and gender violence is portrayed and potentially unprioritized, submerged, or even silenced in the coverage of the May '98 events.

Media has a role in shaping public opinion (Cavanaugh, 2014; Matusitz & Ochoa, 2018) and can be used by some critical social actors to shift specific issues according to what they want (Belair-Gagnon et al., 2019; Langer & Gruber, 2021), thereby shaping narratives. This proves that the theory of Agenda-Setting is still valid in affecting public perception (Luo et al., 2019). Agenda-setting is linked to framing that serves to highlight some specific issues while downgrading others (Princen, 2018). Previous studies highlighted how news is biased or not neutral and tends to influence the public to act according to their agendas (Guo et al., 2021; Randy & Witarti, 2021). These arguments become the foundation of this study in examining how the discourse on gender and ethnic violence is overlooked in the news related to Indonesia's May 1998 Riots.

Agenda-setting theory, pioneered by Maxwell McCombs and Donald Shaw, posits that the media's agenda can influence public opinion and priorities (Griffin et al., 2018). This theory delineates three levels and framing is a concept within the second level of agenda-setting, that involves highlighting specific issues while neglecting others. The silence or suppression of discourses surrounding gender and ethnic violence in news coverage of the May 1998 events may also be attributed to framing. Consequently, this study analyzes how these discourses are submerged or overlooked in media representations.

This study chose Detik.com and CNN Indonesia as the two online news platforms because they stand out as prominent sources of information in

the Indonesian media landscape. Detik.com is recognized as the most consumed online news platform by the Indonesian. (Pahlevi, 2022). CNN Indonesia, an international news outlet with a localized focus and the third most consumed online news platform by Indonesians (Pahlevi, 2022). By examining the narratives presented by these platforms, this study aims to understand how media de-prioritizes, downgrades, or even silences some specific discourses within the broader context of historical events.

This study uses the Critical Analysis of Discourse Studies (CADS) as its methodological framework, providing a systematic approach to investigate the de-prioritization or submersion of discourses on gender and ethnic violence. This analytical lens aims to unveil how the event of mass rape becomes 'The Overlooked Reality' in the news coverage related to Indonesia's May 1998 Riots. This study tries to prove that there is an effort not to show the discourses of gender and ethnic violence in the news, which is also stated by the previous study (Himawan, Pohlman, et al., 2022).

METHODS

This study collected news articles related to Indonesia's May Riots 1998 from Detik.com and CNN Indonesia using Octoparse and Python. Notably, Kompas was excluded from the dataset due to challenges in data collection arising from complex indexing, despite its status as the second most consumed online news platform in Indonesia. To ensure the integrity of the data, the study implemented codes designed to eliminate stop-words, advertisements, and other elements from the news content, leaving only the necessary content of the news. For further information, there are 296 news related to the May Riots 1998 from Detik.com and 261 from CNN Indonesia.

Ancarno (2020) stated that CADS

can integrate close linguistic studies with broader analyses or reveal the discourses behind the corpus. A corpus itself refers to a structured collection of texts or data that is systematically analyzed for research purposes (Baker, 2010). It serves as a representative sample of a language or a specific domain, allowing researchers to examine patterns, trends, and characteristics within the data. CADS (Corpus-Assisted Discourse Studies) analyzes language use in different contexts, providing a comprehensive understanding of discourse patterns and linguistic phenomena (Baker, 2010). The use of CADS in research enables a combination of qualitative and quantitative analysis, resulting in a more complete understanding of language use and conversation patterns. CADS can help researchers better comprehend language variety, discourse markers, collocations, and frames, among other linguistic phenomena (Baker, 2010). For example, CADS was used to examine how Malaysians talked through public letters during the period of Movement Control Order (Joharry, 2020), and in the Indonesian context, CADS also used it to examine the portrayal of women with disabilities in news (Karlina, 2023). Another study in the Indonesian context also used CADS to analyze radicalism in two Islamic newspapers (Bafadhal et al., 2020).

Based on the information above, this study uses CADS as a method to examine the discourse surrounding gender and ethnic violence within the news coverage of the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia. CADS serves as a guiding tool that can be used to explore and decide whether the discourses on gender and ethnic violence in the news concerning the May 1998 riots are genuinely suppressed or not. Furthermore, CADS may help this study by examining how the news related to the riots is framed using the five analyses

(frequency, concordance, collocate, cluster, and keywords). The use of CADS in this study plays a vital role in revealing the dynamics of language use, framing strategies, and potential submerging of specific discourses within the media representations of the May 1998 Riots.

This study used AntConc for analysis. The study employed various techniques related to CADS, such as analysis of frequency, collocation, concordance, cluster, and keywords (Baker, 2010). Frequency analysis is used to identify the most frequently appearing topics in the news related to Indonesia's May Riots of 1998. Concordance analysis examines how the words are used in the corpus. Collocation analysis aims to identify relationships and associations between words in the corpus.

Cluster analysis played a crucial role in identifying discriminatory language use practices, particularly in framing Chinese Indonesians and the riots. This method allowed for a nuanced understanding of how these elements (Chinese Indonesians and the riots themselves) were portrayed in the news. Finally, keyword analysis was utilized to identify words predominantly found in one corpus but not the other. This approach provided insights into the distinctive language usage between Detik.com and CNN Indonesia, contributing to a comprehensive understanding of the discursive nuances within their respective news coverage of the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

This section contains the results of the five CADS, which include analysis of frequency, collocation, concordance, cluster, and keywords. After describing the results, this section will discuss how the results showing the portrayals of the discourse on ethnicity and gender in the news relate to how the discourse is submerged by connecting to the theory.

First is the results of the Frequency analysis. This frequency analysis examines the dominant narratives using the most frequent words appearing in the news or corpus. Table 1 shows what words frequently appear in the corpus.

Next is Concordance Analysis, which determines the context when certain words are used. Table 2 below is

the concordance analysis for the word ‘kerusuhan,’ or riots. The table presents the original text in Indonesian while showing the English-translated version in brackets. The results illustrate that the word ‘kerusuhan’ is frequently used to highlight actors or the government. There are only a few instances where the context refers to ethnic and gender violence.

TABLE 1. The Results Of Frequency Analysis: Top 10 Common Words In The Corpus

Rank	Detik		CNN Indonesia	
	Words	Freq	Words	Freq
1	Civil Rights	1378	Civil Rights	2838
2	May	924	May	1650
3	Jakarta	831	Violation	1529
4	Violation	713	Indonesia	1291
5	Riots	699	Jakarta	1264
6	President	696	President	1252
7	Indonesia	640	Riots	1232
8	Event	582	Events	1207
9	Victim	530	Victim	1200
10	Prabowo	522	People	1135

TABLE 2. The Results Of Concordance Analysis Of The Word ‘Kerusuhan’ Or Riot

Left Context	Hit	Right Context
<i>Mumpung panjang. Partai mengupayakan kekuatan hukum Prabowo Subianto bersih terlibat</i>	<i>kerusuhan</i> (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 berbau SARA terlibat penculikan aktivis Partai Rakyat Demokratik</i>
(Since it is long. The party is endeavoring to harness the legal power of Prabowo Subianto, who is involved)		(May 1998, involving ethnic, religious, racial, and intergroup relations, involved the abduction of activists of the Democratic People’s Party)
<i>Mei 1998. Prof Dr Hermawan Sulistyو mantan Ketua TGPF. berkisah fakta</i>	<i>kerusuhan</i> (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 penculikan pembentukan Dewan Kehormatan Perwira (DKP), Hermawan menyinggung</i>
(May 1998. Prof. Dr. Hermawan Sulistyو, former Chairman of the TGPF, recounts the facts of)		(May 1998, the abduction and formation of the Officers’ Honor Council (DKP), Hermawan tells on)
<i>Asasi Nasional (Komnas HAM) DPR. itu, lembaga menyatakan, Sjafrie terlibat</i>	<i>kerusuhan</i> (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 penculikan aktivis mahasiswa. „“Pak Sjafrie terlibat penculikan aktivis</i>
(National Foundation (Komnas HAM) DPR. In that, the institution stated, Sjafrie is involved in)		(May 1998, the abduction of student activists. ‘Mr. Sjafrie is involved in the abduction of activists.)

<p><i>mantan menantu Soeharto ini. diujung cerita, kesuksesan Prabowo kelabu. Buntut</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 penculikan aktivis, Prabowo dicopot jabatannya Pangkostrad. (djo/)" "Jakarta –</i></p>
<p>(former son-in-law of Soeharto. At the end of the story, Prabowo's success is murky. As a result,)</p>		<p>(May 1998, the abduction of activists, Prabowo was removed from his position as Pangkostrad. (djo/)" "Jakarta)</p>
<p><i>aksi kekerasan pelanggaran HAM itu. Trisakti, Semanggi I II (TSS),</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 penculikan penghilangan aktivis 1997-1998. detikcom mencatat, gerakan reformasi tokoh</i></p>
<p>(acts of violence human rights violations. Trisakti, Semanggi I II (TSS))</p>		<p>(May 1998, the abduction and disappearance of activists 1997-1998. Detik.com wrote, the reform movement figures)</p>
<p><i>Media mengontrol kekerasan pelanggaran Pemilu ini,"" pria keturunan Tionghoa korban</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 ini. menambahkan, Pemilu damai. Jakarta Bangkok Kairo, berujung</i></p>
<p>(Media controls the violence of electoral violations,"" a man of Chinese descent, a victim of)</p>		<p>(May 1998. adds, peaceful elections. Jakarta Bangkok Cairo, ended)</p>
<p><i>Lanjut pria yang pernah berseteru dengan capres Menhankam/Pangab Jenderal (Purn) Wiranto soal dana Pamswakarsa dalam</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 ini. Dia mengelak dalam Pilpres putaran memilih SBY purnawirawan TNI. ""</i></p>
<p>(stated the man who had clashed with presidential candidate Menhankam/Pangab General (Ret) Wiranto regarding Pamswakarsa funds in)</p>		<p>(May 1998. He denies the presidential election round choosing retired TNI General SBY.)</p>
<p><i>beragama Kristen. Ketiga, alasan korban penganiayaan kekerasan dialami warga Cina</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 Jakarta. Keempat, korban pelecehan seksual, kekerasan fisik perampokan.</i></p>
<p>(are Christians. Thirdly, the reasons for the violence and persecution suffered by Chinese residents in)</p>		<p>(May 1998 in Jakarta. Fourthly, victims of sexual harassment, physical violence, and robbery)</p>
<p><i>Gedung Capitol massa pendukung Trump, orang menyamakan insiden Januari 2021 rentetan</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 Jakarta. Thomas Pepinsky, profesor ilmu pemerintahan Universitas Cornell,</i></p>
<p>(Capitol building, Trump supporters, people comparing the January 2021 incident to the series of)</p>		<p>(May 1998 riots in Jakarta. Thomas Pepinsky, a professor of government at Cornell University)</p>
<p><i>diculik rumahnya Jakarta 7 Mei 199811. Ucok Munandar Siahaan: Mahasiswa Perbanas, diculik</i></p>	<p>kerusuhan (riot)</p>	<p><i>Mei 1998 Jakarta12. Yadin Muhidin: alumnus Sekolah Pelayaran, ditahan Polres</i></p>
<p>(abducted from his home in Jakarta on May 7, 199811. Ucok Munandar Siahaan: Perbanas University student, abducted during)</p>		<p>(May 1998 in Jakarta12. Yadin Muhidin: Maritime School alumnus, detained by the Police Headquarters)</p>

<i>Menteri Pemberdayaan Perempuan Meutia Hatta menyerahkan dokumen terkait kejahatan seksual</i>	kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 Jaksa Agung Hendarman Supandji, 24 Mei 2008. Sepuluh sebelumnya, Tim</i>
(Minister of Women's Empowerment Meutia Hatta submits documents related to sexual crimes during)		(May 1998 to Attorney General Hendarman Supandji, May 24, 2008. Ten days prior, the Team)
<i>Pemberdayaan Perempuan Meutia Hatta menyerahkan dokumen terkait kejahatan seksual peristiwa</i>	kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 Jaksa Agung Hendarman Supandji. Dokumen berisi temuan-temuan</i>
(Minister of Women's Empowerment Meutia Hatta submits documents related to sexual crimes during the)		(May 1998 to Attorney General Hendarman Supandji. The documents contain findings regarding)
<i>orator. Petugas kepolisian berjaga mahasiswa menggelar aksi. aksi damai berlangsung.</i>	Kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 kerusuhan Indonesia 13 Mei-15 Mei 1998, Kota Jakarta daerah lain.</i>
(orator. Police officers stand guard as students organize a protest. The peaceful protest continues)		(May 1998, riots in Indonesia from May 13th to May 15th, 1998, in Jakarta and other areas)
<i>ibukota. aksi unjuk lalu, terbukti aparat menindak bersikap anarkis. ""Lihat</i>	kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 lalu. Demo buruh 5 April begitu, "" Fadloli. dia, 08. 30 WIB, 50</i>
(capital. The protest march, it became evident that the authorities acted against the anarchists." ""Look at the)		(in May 1998. The labor demonstration on April 5th was like that,"" said Fadloli. He, at 08:30 AM, 50)
<i>Tanah Abang pulalah menyelamatkan pasar ribuan pedagang menggantungkan pencahariannya peristiwa</i>	kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 lalu. Pasar Tanah Abang lolos maut akibat penjarahan,</i>
(Tanah Abang also saved the market where thousands of traders relied on for their livelihood during the)		(May 1998 (in the past). Tanah Abang Market narrowly escaped looting)
<i>DPP PKB Maria Pakpahan 10. 30-11. 30 WIB. ""Kami DPP PKB statemen publik</i>	kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 pelanggaran HAM berat, "" Lamria. Keluarga korban disidang Pengadilan</i>
(PKB's DPP Maria Pakpahan, from 10:30 to 11:30 AM. ""We, PKB's DPP, make a public statement regarding the)		(in May 1998, serious human rights violations,"" said Lamria. The families of the victims are being tried in court.)
<i>menilai Letjen TNI Sjafrie Sjamsoeddin bertanggungjawab pelanggaran HAM, penculikan aktivis 1997/1998,</i>	Kerusuhan (riot)	<i>Mei 1998 peristiwa Trisakti 1998. Mantan Menteri Pertahanan Juwono Sudarsono menegaskan,</i>
(assesses that Lieutenant General TNI Sjafrie Sjamsoeddin is responsible for human rights violations, the abduction of activists in 1997/1998)		(the May 1998 and the Trisakti incident in 1998. Former Defense Minister Juwono Sudarsono asserts,)

Next is Collocation analysis, which can determine which words are strongly associated with specific words.

This study used collocation analysis to examine which words relate more to the words 'kerusuhan' or riot and 'kekerasan'

or violence. Table 3 shows the results of the Collocation Analysis for the words riot or “*kerusuhan*” in Bahasa Indonesia.

Next, Table 4 shows the results of Collocation Analysis for the word ‘violence’ or “*Kekerasan*” in Bahasa Indonesian in both Detik and CNN corpora.

Next is Cluster Analysis, a method used to identify patterns and groupings of words or concepts within a text corpus. It helps to uncover underlying themes, connections, and relationships among linguistic elements. Table 5 shows the results of cluster analysis for the word ‘*kerusuhan*’:

Next is Keyword analysis, which refers to unique vocabulary that appears in a corpus and is relatively less common in other corpora. The results of keyword analysis are in Tables 6 and 7.

The results of the five CADS analyses (frequency, collocate, concordance, cluster, and keywords) bring the discussion into three parts, which explain the points: (a) the most frequent topics emerged in the news, (b) how the discourses on gender and ethnic violence are submerged, (c) comparison on how Detik and CNN Indonesia frame the riots and Chinese-Indonesian women in the news. Below is the discussion.

The Dominant Narratives: Revealing the Most Frequent Topics in News Coverage

Based on Table 1, which shows the Top 10 words of frequency analysis, there are no words related to the discourse of gender and ethnic violence in the news of Indonesia’s May 1998 Riots. Using concordance analysis to know the context, the words ‘Civil Rights’ in the Indonesian Language refer to the existence of ‘serious human rights violations’ and are used alongside words like Jokowi and Menko Polkuham, which refers to Coordinating Minister for Politics, Law and Security of

Indonesia. These words do not refer to the discourse of gender and ethnic violence in the news. Based on concordance analysis, all the words in Table 2 refer to how the news blames some actors (word: Prabowo) and asks the government (words: Jokowi, President) to take responsibility for events that occurred in history. The words are even used with mentions of other human rights violations in the past, such as the Ambon Riots and the Jambu Kepok riots in South Aceh, and less mention of gender and ethnic violence against Chinese Indonesian women.

In Detik, the word ‘*perempuan*,’ which refers to women, is ranked at 73 with only 117 mentions, while the word ‘*Tionghoa*,’ which refers to Chinese Indonesian, is ranked at 80 with 114 mentions. On CNN, the word women is ranked 98, and Chinese Indonesian is 101, with only four mentions. These prove how gender and ethnic violence are submerged in the news related to Indonesia’s May 1998 riot.

The whole frequency analysis reveals dominant topics based on the most frequently occurring words in the news. Firstly, within the political context, keywords like “*mei*” (May) denote the timeframe of the riots, “*Jakarta*” points to the geographical focus, while terms like “*pelanggaran*” (violation) and “*kerusuhan*” (riot) highlight discussions on infringements and the riots themselves. Secondly, references to political figures and actors such as “*presiden*” (president), “*Prabowo*,” “*Soeharto*,” and “*Wiranto*” indicate political involvement and historical context. Thirdly, terms like “*masyarakat*” (society), “*hukum*” (law), “*hak*” (rights), and “*aktivis*” (activist) suggest discussions on social and legal aspects, including human rights and activist participation. Additionally, specific events and places like “*Trisakti*” University, “*Semanggi*,” and discussions

TABLE 3. Collocation Analysis Of The Word ‘*Kerusuhan*’ Or Riot In Both Detik And Cnn Indonesia

Rank	Detik		CNN	
	Collocate	Freq	Collocate	Freq
1	May	9240	May	16500
2	Event	5820	semanggi	2700
3	Semanggi	1300	events	12070
4	Trisakti	2550	trisakti	4330
5	Mastermind (dalang)	440	Eliminating/ disappearance (penghilangan)	1660
6	Kidnapping	1120	Mastermind (Dalang)	900
7	Malari	800	Forced	1700
8	Riot	699	Kidnapping	1720
9	Eliminating/ disappearance (penghilangan)	600	Malari	1000
10	Forced		Riot	1232

TABLE 4. Collocation Analysis For The Word ‘Violence’ Or Kekerasan

Rank	Detik				CNN Indonesia			
	Collocate	Freq	Likelihood	Effect	Collocate	Freq	Likelihood	Effect
1	Sexual	310	124.641	5.635	Sexual	1210	589.210	5.580
2	Women	1180	120.126	4.221	Women	2490	381.458	4.386
3	Commission	900	69.187	3.953	Commission	2270	274.751	4.157
4	Anti	370	66.715	4.795	Act (tindak)	1000	250.020	4.883
5	Act (tindak)	410	63.896	4.647	Gone	1910	180.300	3.921
6	Ethnic	590	42.791	3.899	Victims	12000	155.653	2.255
7	Contrast (Kontras)	1010	39.984	3.346	Contrast (Kontras)	2110	139.795	3.593
8	Gone	860	39.178	3.471	Anti	690	137.405	4.653
9	Violence	1220	35.228	3.073	Rape	870	72.321	3.804
10	Conflict	830	35.177	3.407	Violence	2900	57.820	2.581

on “*penculikan*” (kidnapping) shed light on significant events and locations tied to the riots. Furthermore, references to “*partai*” (party) and “*pilpres*” (presidential election) indicate discussions related to political parties and elections. Lastly, keywords like “*Tionghoa*” (Chinese-Indonesians), “*perempuan*” (women), and “*bangsa*” (nation) provide insights into discussions on ethnic and social identity, potentially related to gender violence and

national identity.

To summarize the analysis, the six topics that emerged based on frequency analysis are Political Context, Political Figures and Actors, Social and Legal Context, specific events and Places, Political Parties and Elections, and Ethnic and Social Identity. Based on these findings, Ethnic and Social Identity related to the discourses of gender and ethnic violence is ranked 6th and is being

TABLE 5. Cluster Analysis For The Word ‘Kerusuhan’ Or Riot

Cluster (Indonesia Original text)	Cluster (English Translated)	Rank	Freq
kerusuhan mei	May Riots	1	349
kerusuhan itu	That Riots	2	15
kerusuhan Jakarta	Jakarta riots	3	13
kerusuhan merebak	Riots spreaded	4	8
kerusuhan ambon	Ambon riots	5	7
kerusuhan massal	Mass riot	5	7
kerusuhan terjadi	Riots happened	5	7
kerusuhan kemarin	Yesterday riots	8	6
kerusuhan saya	Riots, I	8	6
kerusuhan sosial	Social Riots	8	6

TABLE 6. Keyword - Words That Are Only Found In Detik, Less Found In Cnn

Words	English Translation or Meaning	Keyness (Likelihood)	Keyness (Effect)
Prabowo	Referring to Prabowo, the suspected actor who was involved in the May Riots	35.967	0.012
Poyuono	Suspected actor who was involved in the May Riots	26.611	0.003
Sby	Referring to Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, the 6 th President of Indonesia	21.602	0.003
Gerindra	A Political Party in Indonesia	21.517	0.003

TABLE 7. Keyword - Words That Are Mostly Found In Cnn, Relatively Less Found In Detik

Words (in Indonesian)	English Translation or Meaning	Keyness (Likelihood)	Keyness (Effect)
<i>Kamisan</i>	signifies Thursdays during that time, known for peaceful “Kamisan protests.” Activists and victims’ families held these protests to demand justice for human rights violations, including disappearances.	39.466	0.001
<i>Selain</i>	Besides	31.650	0.001
<i>Rekonsiliasi</i>	reconciliation	31.555	0.002
<i>Piala</i>	Trophy	30.186	0.001
<i>Komite</i>	Committee	29.536	0.001
<i>pemeriksaan</i>	Rape	29.238	0.001

submerged by other issues, such as the political context of the riots and the actors or entities.

The results above lead to the Theory of Agenda Setting and the concept of

Framing. It is stated that the framing concept in The Second Level of Agenda-Setting is used to highlight some specific issues while neglecting others (Griffin et al., 2018)The silencing or submersion

of gender and ethnic violence discourses in the news related to May 1998 may also result from the news framing. By highlighting other issues related to politics, actors, such as Prabowo, Soeharto, Wiranto, and the President (refer to Jokowi and other Indonesian Presidents), social and legal context, the issues related to gender and ethnic violence are submerged or not prioritized.

Besides framing, the findings show how the discourse on Ethnic and Gender Violence in the news related to the May 1998 riots led to a concept called “power dynamics” in the news narrative. By using narrative, actors behind news production can set the stage and a space of possibilities for specific stories to be told in specific ways while limiting others (Gross & Zilber, 2020). Similar findings were reached in the Zimbabwean instance of religious rape, where the three newspapers failed to act as a watchdog since they solely covered judicial processes and failed to reveal religious, sexual abuse, or the sexual abuse that religious leaders were committing. (Ndhlovu, 2020).

The limitation of discourse on gender and ethnic violence in Indonesia’s May 1998 Riots may be related to the victims themselves, who often do not want to share their stories due to trauma or other personal reasons. Additionally, social stigma, fear of retribution, and lack of trust in the legal system may further silence victims, preventing their stories from being told. Previous research indicates that news articles often highlight the personal stories of sexual violence victims and their need for legal representation, yet this human-interest framing is rarely found in news about campus sexual violence regulations (Chasana et al., 2023). This might be because most victims are either unwilling or pressured to remain silent, causing the discourse of violence to be submerged.

Consequently, the media’s portrayal of such events remains fragmented or not whole, with significant aspects of gender and ethnic violence receiving inadequate attention and diminishing the potential for public awareness and advocacy for justice.

Submerged Discourses, Overlooked Realities: Examining the News’ Deprioritization of Gender and Ethnic Violence Discourses

Based on previous results, the discourse on gender and ethnic violence is submerged because the related news is focused on the political context and actors. This study uses collocation analysis to delve deeper into how these discourses are suppressed or submerged. Table 2 shows the collocation analysis of the word ‘kerusuhan’ or riot in Detik and CNN Indonesia. The collocation analysis of the word ‘kerusuhan’ or riots shows that it does not correlate with Indonesian-Chinese or ethnic issues; thus, both Detik and CNN do not mention Indonesian-Chinese as the victims of the riot in a transparent manner.

Based on Table 4, the word “kerusuhan” is linked to particular events, places (Semanggi and Trisakti), and ideas like masterminds, kidnappings, and the use of force during the May 1998 riots, based on the collocation analysis in both Detik and CNN Indonesia. The collocation analysis of both corpora (Detik and CNN Indonesia) does not show a direct correlation between riots and the discourse of ethnicity and gender. Thus, this study further conducted collocation analysis for the word ‘violence’ or ‘kekerasan’ in the Indonesian language. Based on Table 3 above, the collocation analysis indicates that the term “kekerasan” or violence is associated with various dimensions of violence in both Detik and CNN corpora, including sexual violence, anti-violence efforts, and violence against women.

Ethnic violence is more clearly shown in Detik rather than CNN Indonesia because of the existence of the word ‘ethnic’ that ranks number 6 (refer to Table 4).

In collocation analysis results of the word “kerusuhan” or riot, both corpora consistently show relationships with significant places, dates, and political aspects; yet, the analyses of “kekerasan” uncover important thematic distinctions. CNN is more focused on anti-violence acts with emphasis on rape. The findings reveal an implicit de-prioritization of gender and ethnic violence discourses within the overall narratives of the May 1998 Riots.

This study also conducted cluster analysis for the words ‘kerusuhan’ for further analysis. The results show that though there is a word riot surrounding ‘Indonesian-Chinese’ or *Tionghoa*, when reversed, the ‘Indonesian-Chinese’ word does not appear surrounding ‘riot.’ Thus, the news does not show that there is gender and ethnic violence in the riots. The cluster analysis confirms the dominant narrative priority identified in previous results. While the clusters emphasize elements such as the riots’ temporal dimensions, geographical distribution, and scale, the lack of specific clusters relating to gender or ethnic violence highlights the potential de-prioritization of these discourses within news narratives. Thus, the collocation and cluster analysis prove that there is a possibility of submerging the discourses on gender and ethnic violence by emerging issues like political context, government actors and entities, and other agendas such as asking for responsibility from governments.

The fact that the discourse of ethnic and social identity related to gender and ethnic violence is submerged in the news about the May Riots 1998 can be related to the dominance of other themes, such as the political background of the riots and the characters featured in the news. The

news media concentrated on the political aspects and the parties involved in the riots rather than on ethnic and social identity concerns. The framing theory holds that news outlets deliberately highlight some parts of an event while downplaying others (Coleman et al., 2020; Griffin et al., 2018), might be responsible for or may explain this finding. In this case, the news media focused on the political context and the actors involved, sinking the debate over ethnic and social identity. Furthermore, institutional networks such as journalists, editors, directors, and publishers influenced how the news was framed.

Framing the Riots: A Comparative Analysis of Riot and Chinese-Indonesian Women Framed by Detik and CNN Indonesia

To examine how Detik and CNN Indonesia frame Indonesia’s May 1998 Riots, a keyword analysis may reveal distinctive vocabulary that sets these two online platforms apart. Notably, specific keywords emerge more prominently in one corpus than the other, shedding light on unique focal points and framing choices. Based on Tables 6 and 7, which show the Keyword analysis results, CNN Indonesia has more unique terms than Detik.

The prevalence of these keywords in Detik’s corpus suggests a particular emphasis on political figures, namely Prabowo and SBY, and political entities like Gerindra (one of the political parties in Indonesia led by Prabowo). This may indicate Detik’s inclination toward political dimensions in its coverage of the May 1998 Riots. Conversely, CNN Indonesia’s corpus is characterized by keywords such as ‘*kamisan* (the longest-running human rights protest that demands stem from crimes perpetrated during the totalitarian New Order administration),’ ‘*rekonsiliasi*’ or reconciliation, and

'*pemeriksaan*' or rape, signaling a distinctive focus on events and issues related to activism, reconciliation, and sexual assault. *Kamisan* is the longest-running human rights protest, whose demands stem from crimes perpetrated during the totalitarian New Order administration (1966-1998). However, it also exposes present human rights issues and perpetrators unpunished (Setiawan, 2022).

The difference in the results of keywords analysis reflects distinct narrative choices made by Detik and CNN Indonesia in framing the May 1998 Riots. Detik emphasized political figures, while CNN Indonesia's incorporation of media-related terms and issues like reconciliation and sexual assault led to discussion of a broader societal and human-focused approach. This comparative analysis highlights the different priorities of Detik and CNN Indonesia in framing the discourse of gender and ethnic violence within the May 1998 Riots. Detik's political focus may inadvertently lead to the de-prioritization of gender and ethnic violence. In contrast, CNN Indonesia's inclusion of keywords related to human rights advocacy and specific protests (*aksi Kamisan*) demonstrates a commitment to more comprehensive and nuanced coverage.

However, from the collocation analysis, Detik has shown stronger collocation or association between the words 'violence' and 'ethnic,' showing more apparent discourse on ethnic violence. Both Detik and CNN Indonesia also show a strong association between the words 'violence,' 'women,' and 'sexual,' meaning that the news covers discourse on gender violence. However, it is not prioritized or submerged by other topics or issues. This submersion is shown in the result of collocation analysis for the word 'riot,' one of the most frequent words appearing on the news topic, which does

not strongly associate with the words 'women,' 'ethnic,' or gender issues.

To examine how Detik and CNN Indonesia frame Indonesia's May 1998 Riots, this study applies Agenda-Setting and Framing Theories alongside Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) and Corpus Linguistics methods. Agenda-setting theory helps us understand how these media outlets prioritize different issues, with Detik focusing on political figures like Prabowo and SBY and political entities such as Gerindra. This prioritization suggests Detik's inclination toward political dimensions in its coverage of the riots. Conversely, CNN Indonesia emphasizes human rights and gender violence, indicated by keywords such as '*kamisan* (the longest-running human rights protest that demands stem from crimes perpetrated during the totalitarian New Order administration),' '*rekonsiliasi* or reconciliation,' and '*pemeriksaan* or rape.' This reflects CNN Indonesia's focus on activism, reconciliation, and sexual assault, underscoring different priorities in setting the public agenda.

Agenda-setting and Framing Theory provide insight into how Detik and CNN Indonesia select and emphasize certain aspects of the riots. Detik's framing through political figures and parties may inadvertently lead to the de-prioritization of ethnic and gender violence narratives. In contrast, CNN Indonesia's inclusion of terms related to human rights protests and gender violence suggests a broader societal and human-focused approach. This framing choice by CNN Indonesia results in a more nuanced coverage of these critical issues.

The Agenda Setting theory, viewed as a feature of the media, acknowledges that the media shapes public agendas by providing information on what is next on the agenda that should be considered essential (Ajakaiye et al., 2023). This is sufficient since the media occasionally

tells people what to believe rather than what to think (Ajakaiye et al., 2023). In the analysis, Detik and CNN Indonesia demonstrate distinct approaches to agenda-setting. Detik's emphasis on political figures like Prabowo and SBY and political parties such as Gerindra highlights its prioritization of political narratives. This focus aligns with the theory's assertion that the media can set agendas by highlighting specific topics. However, this emphasis on political dimensions tends to submerge issues of ethnic and gender violence, which receive less attention in Detik's coverage.

Conversely, CNN Indonesia's use of keywords such as '*kamisan* (the longest-running human rights protest that demands stem from crimes perpetrated during the totalitarian New Order administration),' '*rekonsiliasi* or reconciliation,' and '*pemerkosaan* or rape' underscores its focus on human rights and social justice issues. This approach aligns with the second level of Agenda Setting, where the media tells people what to consider important and how to think about those issues through specific framing (Griffin et al., 2018). CNN Indonesia's framing illuminates the narratives of ethnic and gender violence, integrating these crucial topics into the broader societal discourse. This difference in agenda-setting and framing by online news platforms reveals how media outlets can shape public perception and awareness of significant issues.

Through Critical Discourse Analysis, this research explores the power dynamics and social implications of the language used, revealing how narratives around ethnic and gender violence are constructed or submerged (Beazer et al., 2023). For instance, collocation analysis shows that while both the two online newspapers cover gender violence, the association between the word 'riot' and terms like 'women' and 'ethnic' is

weak, indicating that other topics often overshadow these issues. Detik shows a stronger collocation between 'violence' and 'ethnic,' suggesting a more apparent discourse on ethnic violence, whereas CNN Indonesia's coverage includes a focus on human rights and advocacy.

Corpus Linguistics methods, including keyword and collocation analysis, uncover distinctive vocabularies and associations within the news coverage (Baker, 2010). The analysis demonstrates that Detik's political focus may lead to the de-prioritization of gender and ethnic violence. In contrast, CNN Indonesia's human rights-oriented coverage includes these issues more prominently, though they are still often submerged by other topics. This comparative analysis highlights the different narrative choices and priorities of Detik and CNN Indonesia in framing the discourse of the May 1998 Riots, illustrating how media framing can influence public understanding and awareness of ethnic and gender violence.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study explored the complexity of media dynamics, concentrating on the stories that surfaced from two well-known online platforms, CNN Indonesia and Detik.com, about the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia. Using the theory of Agenda-Setting and employing the methodological framework of Critical Analysis of Discourse Studies (CADS), this study's primary aim is to reveal the layers of information presented to the public related to news of Indonesia's May 1998 Riots.

The foundational argument of this study, derived from the Agenda-Setting theory, is that media can influence public opinion by selecting and emphasizing specific issues. Through this lens, this study examined the coverage of the May 1998 Riots in the media, giving more attention to how discourses about

gender and ethnic violence were either silenced or submerged. While previous studies have emphasized the silencing of particular narratives, particularly the May '98 mass rape, this study adds value by shedding light on how these stories are de-prioritized about the more significant historical context.

However, it is crucial to acknowledge that the study does not aim to exaggerate the phenomenon but rather to present an objective analysis of the discourse surrounding gender and ethnic violence. By employing CADS, this study aims to understand the extent of submersion and to what degree these discourses were marginalized within the news coverage.

This research's contribution to the media studies field lies in its analysis of media framing and discourse submersion. By employing CADS, this study provides a comprehensive understanding of the extent to which discourses on gender and ethnic violence were submerged in news coverage. This approach enhances the understanding of media dynamics during critical historical events and underscores the media's dual role as a reflector and driver of public narratives. This study also emphasizes how crucial it is to recognize hidden narratives in news reports that might not be immediately obvious. This emphasizes the importance of critical media literacy and the continuous analysis of how the media portrays sensitive societal topics.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The author would like to thank the University of Indonesia for making this research possible.

REFERENCES

Ahmadi, A. (2021). The traces of oppression and trauma to ethnic minorities in indonesia who experienced rape on the 12 may 1998 tragedy: A review of literature. *Journal of Ethnic and*

- Cultural Studies*, 8(2), 126–144. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejecs/744>
- Ajakaiye, O. O. P., Rachael, O.-J., Owoeye, G., Ayantunji, K. A.-A., Apalowo, J. T., & Akerele-Popoola, O. E. (2023). Media and Public Opinion in West Africa: An Interplay of Agenda Setting, Agenda Building and Framing Theories. In *Media and Communication Theory in Africa* (pp. 151–179). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-14717-3_7
- Ancarno, C. (2020). Corpus-Assisted Discourse Studies. In A. De Fina & A. Georgakopoulou (Eds.), *The Cambridge Handbook of Discourse Studies* (pp. 165–185). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108348195.009>
- Bafadhal, O. M., Meilinda, N., Murti, K., & Santoso, A. D. (2020). What They Do Not Talk about When They Talk about Radicalism: (A Corpus-assisted Discourse Analysis on Islamic News Portals in Indonesia). *Mediator: Jurnal Komunikasi*, 13(2), 178–190. <https://doi.org/10.29313/mediator.v13i2.5859>
- Baker, P. (2010). *Sociolinguistics and Corpus Linguistics* (P. Kerswill & J. Swann (eds.)). Edinburgh Sociolinguistics.
- Beazer, A., Walter, S., Eldridge, S. A., & Palicki, S. K. (2023). On the Margins: Exploring Minority News Media Representations of Women during the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Digital Journalism*, 0(0), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2023.2206039>
- Belair-Gagnon, V., Holton, A. E., & Westlund, O. (2019). Space for the liminal. *Media and Communication*, 7(4), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.17645/mac.v7i4.2666>
- Budiyanto, L. (2022). The Control Over Perception of Mass Violence Through Strategic Labelling. *Diskursus*, 18(2), 192–217.
- Cavanaugh, P. (2014). Mass Shootings, Mass Media, and Mass Opinion: An Examination of How the News Media Affects Public Opinion in the Aftermath of Mass Shootings. *Res Publica-Journal of Undergraduate Research*, 19(1). <http://digitalcommons.iwu.edu/respublica/vol19/iss1/8http://>

- digitalcommons.iwu.edu/respublica/vol19/iss1/8
- Chasana, R. R. B., Putri, D. A. P., & Vernanda, Y. (2023). A Content Analysis of Polemics in a Regulation Regarding Sexual Violence on Campus. *Mediator: Jurnal Komunikasi*, 16(2), 144–155. <https://doi.org/10.29313/mediator.v16i1.2217>
- Coleman, R., McCombs, M., Shaw, D., & Weaver, D. (2020). Agenda Setting. In K. Wahl-Jorgensen & T. Hanitsch (Eds.), *The Handbook of Journalism Studies* (2nd ed.). Routledge: Taylor & Francis Group.
- Griffin, E., Ledbetter, A., & Sparks, G. (2018). *A First Look at Communication Theory* (10th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.
- Gross, T., & Zilber, T. B. (2020). Power Dynamics in Field-Level Events: A Narrative Approach. *Organization Studies*, 41(10), 1369–1390. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0170840620907197>
- Guo, L., Mays, K., Zhang, Y., Wijaya, D., & Betke, M. (2021). What Makes Gun Violence a (Less) Prominent Issue? A Computational Analysis of Compelling Arguments and Selective Agenda Setting. *Mass Communication and Society*, 24(5), 651–675. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15205436.2021.1898644>
- Himawan, E. M., Louis, W., & Pohlman, A. (2022). Indonesian Civilians' Attributions for Anti-Chinese Violence During the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*, 10(2), 536–553. <https://doi.org/10.5964/jspp.5489>
- Himawan, E. M., Pohlman, A., & Louis, W. (2022). Revisiting the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia: Civilians and Their Untold Memories. *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs*, 41(2), 240–257. <https://doi.org/10.1177/18681034221084320>
- Joharry, S. A. (2020). Examining Malaysian Public Letters to Editor on COVID-19 Pandemic: A Corpus-assisted Discourse Analysis. *GEMA Online® Journal of Language Studies*, 20(3), 242–260. <https://doi.org/10.17576/gema-2020-2003-14>
- Karlina, Y. (2023). Corpus-Assisted Discourse Study (Cads): Women With Disabilities in Kompas.Com'S News Reporting. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Pengajarannya*, 16(2). <https://doi.org/10.26858/retorika.v16i2.45222>
- Langer, A. I., & Gruber, J. B. (2021). Political Agenda Setting in the Hybrid Media System: Why Legacy Media Still Matter a Great Deal. *International Journal of Press/Politics*, 26(2), 313–340. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161220925023>
- Luo, Y., Burley, H., Moe, A., & Sui, M. (2019). A Meta-Analysis of News Media's Public Agenda-Setting Effects, 1972-2015. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 96(1), 150–172. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077699018804500>
- Matusitz, J., & Ochoa, D. (2018). Agenda-Setting Theory in the U.S. Media: A Comparative Analysis of Terrorist Attacks in France and Nigeria. *Global Media Journal*, 16(31), 1. https://search.proquest.com/docview/2162427823?accountid=17215%0Ahttps://limo.libis.be/services/KULEuven?url_ver=Z39.88-2004&rft_val_fmt=info:ofi/fmt:kev:mtx:journal&-genre=unknown&sid=ProQ:ProQ%3Asociology&atitle=Agenda-Setting+Theory+in+the+U.S.+Media%3A
- Ndhlovu, M. P. (2020). Examining media discourses on religious rape in Zimbabwe. *Feminist Media Studies*, 20(6), 801–812. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14680777.2020.1722724>
- Pahlevi, R. (2022). *Ini Media Online Paling Banyak Dikonsumsi Warga Indonesia*. Katadata. <https://databoks.katadata.co.id/datapublish/2022/06/16/ini-media-online-paling-banyak-dikonsumsi-warga-indonesia>
- Princen, S. (2018). Agenda-Setting and Framing in Europe. In *The Palgrave Handbook of Public Adminis-*

- tration and Management in Europe* (pp. 535–551). Palgrave Macmillan UK. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-55269-3_28
- Randy, D., & Witarti, D. I. (2021). BBC Allegedly Used Leave Campaigners Ideology to Frame EU Referendum. *Mediator: Jurnal Komunikasi*, 14(1), 124–136. <https://doi.org/10.29313/mediator.v14i1.6802>
- Setiawan, K. M. P. (2022). Struggling for justice in post-authoritarian states: human rights protest in Indonesia. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 26(3), 541–565. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13642987.2021.1947805>